

Student Achievement Leadership Team Resource Kit #9

Does arts education in public schools increase student achievement? December 2004

> Ohio School Boards Association 8050 North High Street, Suite 100 Columbus, Ohio 43235-6482 (614) 540-4000 • fax (614) 540-4100

Contents

Message from OSBA President Dr. Michael G. Grote
Talking points for arts education
Despite budget cuts, NCLB mandates, support for arts is strong
The Complete Curriculum: Ensuring a place for the arts in America's schools
Characteristics of students highly involved in the arts
Report shows the arts' critical link to student development
Ohio's K-12 fine arts standards15
Lima City Schools adopt arts content standards16
Questions to ask about your school art program
Additional resources
Ohio has many arts-related businesses

The OSBA Student Achievement Leadership Team consists of the following school board members:

Dr. Michael G. Grote, OSBA president and chair, Delaware City & Delaware Area Career Center, (740) 363-4789

Walter Armes, Whitehall City, (614) 231-0349

Cheryl M. Clark, Elida Local (Allen), (419) 339-2624

Cathye J. Flory, Logan-Hocking Local (Hocking) & Tri-County Career Center, (740) 385-6365

Larry E. Holdren, Washington County ESC & Washington County JVSD, (740) 989-2447

Catherine D. Ingram, Cincinnati City, (513) 621-3693

Sharon E. Manson, Waverly City & Pike County Area JVSD, (740) 947-2973

Dr. Florence M. Newell, Cincinnati City, (513) 731-8683

Brenda A. Pryor, South Euclid-Lyndhurst City, (216) 691-9130

Gail Requardt, East Muskingum Local (Muskingum) & Mid-East Career and Technology Center, (740) 826-4953

Marty Rothey, Findlay City, (419) 424-8900

William Spahr, Xenia Community City & Greene County JVSD, (937) 376-1614

For more information on the OSBA Student Achievement Initiative, contact one of the SALT members or

Ohio School Boards Association 8050 North High Street, Suite 100 Columbus, Ohio 43235-6482 (614) 540-4000 • fax (614) 540-4100 Web site at www.osba-ohio.org



Dear school board members, superintendents and treasurers:

It is tough balancing the school district budget while striving to raise student achievement in our public schools. On one hand, we are trying to incorporate innovative programs to improve learning, but having to cut other programs because of limited financial resources.

Since OSBA adopted the Student Achievement Initiative in November 1998, we have been bombarded with creative ways to restructure, redefine, recreate and reevaluate public education. The Student Achievement Leadership Team has provided OSBA members with a number of programs to help them find ways to raise the bar: the Student Achievement Liaison program, the annual symposium in March, the Capital Conference student achievement activities and learning tracks, and many resource kits. Several of the resource kits highlighted best practices in the classroom. Just this September, the SALT Resource Kit #8 featured some outstanding programs found in our career centers and vocational programs throughout Ohio.

We've looked far and wide for answers. Some in arts education might borrow words from Glinda, the Witch of the North in the "Wizard of Oz," when she tells Dorothy Gale, "You've always had the power...." Yes, maybe we already have the answer in arts education. This resource kit looks at the arguments and studies supporting the idea that students who participate in arts education do better in school.

While you struggle to find the right combination of efficiency and effectiveness in academics, consider the information in this kit. We hope it helps you make better, informed decisions.

Michael G Grots

Dr. Michael G. Grote OSBA president member of the Delaware City and Delaware Area Career Center boards

Talking points for arts education

Courtesy of the Ohio Alliance for Arts Education

What do we mean by arts education?

The arts include the disciplines of dance, drama/theater, music and visual arts. Arts education teaches students to use acquired knowledge and skills to respond to works of art (describe, analyze and interpret), perform existing works in the arts and create original works in the arts.

Who supports arts education?

Many prominent national leaders agree that arts education is the key to developing knowledge and skills for work and life in the 21st century. All major educational organizations, including the National PTA, National School Boards Association, National Association of Elementary School Principals, National Association of Secondary School Principals, National Education Association, the American Federation of Teachers, the National Endowment for the Arts, Americans for the Arts and other organizations, support arts education.

The National Conference of State Legislatures emphasized the importance of arts education in its 1992 publication Reinventing the Wheel: A Design for Student Achievement in the 21st Century. The National Association of State Boards of Education recommended ensuring a place for the arts in America's schools in a study called The Complete Curriculum (see page 6), which was released in 2003. The arts are included in the core curriculum outlined in the Goals 2000: Educate America Act, in the Improving America's School Act approved by Congress in 1994 and in the No Child Left Behind Act 2001. All states have adopted or are planning to adopt state academic standards for the arts, and some states assess achievement in the arts and require students to complete a credit in the arts to qualify for high school graduation.

According to President George W. Bush,

"From music and dance to painting and sculpting, the arts allow us to explore new worlds and to view life from another perspective. They also encourage individuals to sharpen their skills and abilities and to nurture their imagination and intellect."

The Ohio Alliance for Arts Education (OAAE) is working in partnership with the Ohio Arts Council and the Ohio Department of Education to promote high-quality arts education programs in Ohio for all students. The OAAE was formed in 1974, and includes over 20 statewide organizations that support the arts and arts education. The OAAE also is affiliated nationally with arts education organizations in other states through the Kennedy Center for the Arts in Washington, D.C.

How can arts education be improved in Ohio?

The arts are an essential component of a high quality general education. The OAAE is working to provide the leadership to raise expectations for arts education for all students, promote learning opportunities in the arts and improve arts education programs in Ohio. The following are some activities that arts education advocates can do to support achievement of OAAE goals:

• Make personal contacts with policymakers and elected officials to promote high-quality arts education programs in your schools and communities.

• Build support for the arts with colleagues, parents and community organizations, and recruit spokespersons for arts education from these groups.

• Write editorials for local newspapers that support the development and implementation of state academic content standards for the arts and adequate resources and facilities for arts education programs.

Despite budget cuts, NCLB mandates, support for arts is strong

by Ellie Ashford editor School Board News

At a time when many school boards are facing increasing pressures to shift scarce resources from arts education to math and reading, there's also a movement among some school districts and education leaders to strengthen arts programs.

"No Child Left Behind (NCLB) and states' economies are having an impact," says **Sara Goldhawk**, senior project associate for partnership development at the Arts Education Partnership. "We are hearing that time might be taken away from the arts for reading and math. But we don't have hard data that arts budgets are being cut."

Lack of incentives

Sharon Wuorenmaa, arts and humanities specialist for the Jefferson County, Ky., school district, acknowledges, "The arts get short shrift when there is limited money and, with NCLB, there's a huge push for reading and math."

An elementary school principal with low reading scores, for example, is more likely to hire a reading teacher rather than a certified art teacher, she says.

A recent report by the Council for Basic Education, "Academic Atrophy: The Condition of the Liberal Arts in America's Public Schools," found that schools are spending substantially less time on the arts — as well as social studies, civics and foreign languages — since NCLB was enacted.

The Complete Curriculum, a report issued last year by the National Association of State Boards of Education (see page 6), expresses concerns about the de-emphasis of arts and foreign languages as an unintended consequence of NCLB. "As educators and policymakers focus on leaving no child behind," it says, "many are wondering whether our nation's schools may inadvertently leave half of the child's education behind."

Jennifer Chowning, arts education coordinator for Americans for the Arts, adds "There is little incentive to offer the arts when it's not tested, especially since arts education is expensive and requires a long-term commitment and special facilities."

In response to such concerns, then-U.S. Education Secretary **Rod Paige** sent a letter to school superintendents in July underscoring the importance of arts education.

"As I travel the country, I often hear that arts education programs are endangered because of (NCLB)," Paige writes. This message is both "disturbing and just plain wrong," because NCLB includes the arts as a core academic subject and school districts can use Title I and other federal funding to support arts education activities.

"The arts have a significant role in education, both for their intrinsic value and for the ways in which they can enhance general academic achievement and improve students' social and emotional development," Paige states.

The secretary also hired **Doug Herbert**, formerly of the National Endowment for the Arts, as a special assistant to serve as an adviser on arts education issues.

Paige's letter "makes the case that many of us have made for years: that schools can improve teaching and learning by using the arts and that schools should therefore use their regular funding to support arts education," states a letter to state and local arts education advocates from **Andy Finch**, senior director of government affairs at Americans for the Arts.

Yet, he continues, "We all know that NCLB provides a disincentive for schools to invest in the arts unless school officials take the time and trouble to investigate how the arts help them meet their reading and math goals."

The U.S. Department of Education's Arts in

Education Model Development and Dissemination program is designed to overcome that obstacle, he adds, but the department did not request funding for it.

The National School Boards Association is working with Americans for the Arts on a survey of National Affiliate school districts on arts education and a tool kit for school board members to help them become better advocates for the arts in their communities.

Strong policies needed

In light of the pressures to de-emphasize the arts, it takes strong state or local policies for school districts to push for comprehensive arts education programs.

Arkansas Gov. **Mike Huckabee**, who took over as chair of the Education Commission of the States (ECS) in July, says his top priority at ECS is "integrating the arts into the K-12 curriculum as a way to improve student achievement and train students for the knowledge-based work force."

"The governor believes an education that doesn't include the arts isn't a complete education," says spokesperson **Jim Harris**. "Music is particularly important, because studies have shown that students who learn music do better on math and other academic subjects."

Denver's arts education programs got a boost last year, when voters passed a \$20 million property tax increase that included \$6.5 million for elementary school arts programs.

The new money will allow Denver to hire 97 new art and music teachers — an average of one per elementary school — along with supplies and funds to start new programs, says district spokesperson **Tanya Caughey**.

The district's goal is to provide elementary students with a standards-driven level of arts awareness and experiences in visual arts, vocal music, instrumental music, drama and dance.

"Art should be used as a way to get at content, not as icing on the cake, but part of the cake," says **Peter Sherman**, principal of Park Hill Elementary School, which has had to rely heavily on community resources to supplement its arts programs.

In California, the Los Angeles County Arts Commission worked with 82 school districts and other organizations to develop a vision for arts education and a series of strategies to accomplish its goals.

The group's report, "Arts for All," recommends that the arts should be part of the core curriculum of every K-12 student. It says sequential instruction in multiple arts disciplines should be scheduled into the school day and included in the budget of every school district in the county.

The Pasadena Unified School District, one of five districts chosen by Los Angeles County to come up with an exemplary arts education program, worked with a group of community members, teachers, parents, administrators and representatives of arts organizations to develop a plan. In June, the school board approved a comprehensive plan to strengthen arts education and boost funding to 5% of the district's budget in 10 years.

"There is a lot of support for the arts in this district and in the community," says Deputy Superintendent **Kathleen Duba**. Pasadena has many active arts groups and the city also has approved a cultural plan for the community that includes arts education, she says, so "there is a real synergy there."

With so many movie and music companies based in southern California, she says, the arts are extremely important to the local economy. In fact, the school district is using money generated from allowing schools to serve as locations in movies and videos to support the arts education effort.

Focusing on arts education while the district must devote resources to complying with NCLB is a "struggle," Duba says, but "we feel the arts is part of the core curriculum. We want to be sure every single child has access to the arts."

Private funding sources

In districts where tight budgets threaten arts programs, school leaders have sought private funding.

In New York City, the nonprofit Center for Arts Education has provided more than \$28 million to the city's public schools since it was founded in 1996 with support from the Annenberg Foundation.

In addition, arts education is one of the key priorities of the Fund for Public Schools, a nonprofit, fund-raising organization affiliated with the New York City school system. Last year, the fund helped organize the AOL Concert for the Schools, which raised more than \$1 million for music education.

On a much smaller scale, in Louisville, Ky., the Commonwealth Institute for Parent Leadership, a component of the Prichard Committee for Academic Excellence, a statewide advocacy organization, has trained 12 parents to help start art enrichment projects in Jefferson County schools.

"Parents can do things teachers can't do, such as provide supplies and arrange for performances," says **Kerry Zack**, manager of the institute.

The Catoosa County, Ga., school district, which has a limited arts budget, has gotten help from Allied Arts, a group based in nearby Chattanooga, Tenn., to subsidize the cost of field trips for lower-income students to concerts and museums in Chattanooga, reports Superintendent **Beth Kellerhals**.

In addition, she notes, **Larry Burch**, the head art instructor at Ringgold High School, and his students have developed "art boxes" for elementary school teachers. The boxes are loaded with information on the geography and history of a particular cultural area, along with enough materials for every student in a class to make at least one art project related to that area.

Benefits of arts

"We know that when children have music and art in their lives, they perform better academically," says **Stephen Gonzalez**, manager of the Denver school district's music program. "Arts education teaches kids to express themselves creatively and be more tolerant and open. It promotes individuality and bolsters self-confidence in addition to improving overall academic performance."

Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development, a compendium of studies published by the Arts Education Partnership in 2002, suggests that "the interrelationships between learning in certain forms of music instruction and the development of cognitive skills, such as spatial reasoning, appear incontrovertible."

Other reports cite additional benefits. The arts can motivate youths who are disengaged from school, connect students to themselves and one another, and connect learning experiences to the world of real work.

And Huckabee notes that the arts give children a long-term benefit. He says none of his former high school football teammates are still playing the sport, but youths who learn to paint or play an instrument can do it for the rest of their lives.

Reprinted with permission from School Board News, Aug. 24, 2004. Copyright 2004 National School Boards Association. All rights reserved.

The Complete Curriculum: Ensuring a place for the arts in America's schools

by Lori Meyer

National Association of State Boards of Education

State policymakers have invested unprecedented resources in recent years developing standards and accountability systems to improve teaching and learning, and policymakers and practitioners alike are hopeful that the impact of standards-based reform will improve student achievement nationwide. But, with most states emphasizing accountability in only a few academic subjects, many are concerned that teachers, schools and districts are emphasizing those few subjects at the expense of other important components of a comprehensive education, such as the arts and foreign languages.

The passage of the No Child Left Behind Act (NCLB) has further raised concerns about the narrowing of the curriculum. While NCLB includes the arts as part of a core curriculum, many fear that there is an unintended consequence: that states will focus their attention — and resources — on complying with the law's primary emphasis on reading, math and science, to the detriment of other curricular areas. As educators and policymakers focus on leaving *no* child behind, many are wondering whether our nation's schools may inadvertently leave *half of the child's education* behind.

Overwhelmingly, parents and the public at large support a comprehensive education, one that includes the arts, history, civics, geography and foreign languages, in addition to other core subjects such as English, mathematics and science. Whether the label is a well-rounded education, liberal arts education or comprehensive education, the goal is the same: to prepare students for the working world, for their roles and responsibilities as citizens in a democracy, and for life in an increasingly interdependent and culturally diverse world. In 2003, the board of directors for the National Association of State Boards of Education charged the Study Group on the Lost Curriculum with examining the current status of curriculum in our nation's schools, particularly as regards the arts and foreign languages. After a year of intense study, the group drew several important conclusions about the status of these subjects.

First, the study group concluded that there is a substantial body of research that highlights the benefits of including the arts in the curriculum. Even beyond their intrinsic value, more and more studies have found that actively engaging in the arts increases academic achievement. For example, the link between music and "spatial relations" reasoning used in math and language development is particularly well documented.

Second, while the Study Group on the Lost Curriculum found that the arts are not necessarily "lost," this subject area has often been marginalized and increasingly at risk of being lost as part of the core curriculum. For example, while virtually every state has adopted standards in the arts, only a few have incorporated the subject into their state accountability systems. Perhaps most alarming are current education reforms. These reforms inadvertently place the arts at risk as policymakers and administrators comply with new federal requirements and choose to narrow the curriculum to reach higher student achievement.

To address these two key conclusions, the Study Group on the Lost Curriculum formulated 10 recommendations for state policymakers to ensure that the arts and foreign languages are not lost, and more importantly, to position both as integral parts of the core curriculum. The remainder of this article presents these recommendations as they pertain to the arts. Readers should be aware, however, that the recommendations as drafted by the study group applied equally to the subject area of foreign languages.

Standards for students and staff

In order to ensure a role for arts in a standards-based system equal to that of other core subject areas, state policymakers must ensure that there are high-quality standards for what students should be able to learn and know in the arts. At the national level, much work has gone into developing student standards for arts education. In 1992, the Consortium of National Arts Education Associations received a grant to begin looking into developing standards for students. The result was the National Standards for Arts Education, which focused on the arts for their intrinsic value in helping young people make connections between concepts and across subjects. The standards also addressed cultural diversity and technology.

A majority of states have developed content standards for the arts, thus creating a solid foundation for learning in this area. However, there are still a few states that have not developed such standards. Developing and adopting high-quality standards is critical for creating a solid foundation for an education system. In addition, those states that have adopted standards should periodically review and update state standards to take advantage of the wealth of information incorporated into the national standards for the arts.

Recommendation 1

Adopt high-quality licensure requirements for staff in the arts that are aligned with student standards in this subject area.

It also is important for states to adopt standards for teacher licensure for the arts. With regard to developing and approving standards for teachers that are *aligned with student standards*, policy traditionally has not been as strong — regardless of the subject area. This is a critical juncture, however, as the new requirements of NCLB have placed on states the responsibility to ensure a highly qualified teacher in every classroom. How states will alter licensure requirements for arts teachers remains unclear. What is clear is that this is a key moment, because state policymakers have an opportunity to set requirements for teachers of the arts that will ensure high-quality instruction.

Several national organizations that focus on teacher licensing, such as the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards, the Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium and the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education, have done a great deal of work in the arts to develop standards for teachers that are aligned with national standards for students. These organizations developed resources, with input from national associations, that states can use in developing or reviewing licensure requirements.

States should establish separate licensure areas for each of the K-12 arts disciplines. For example, few states even have basic licensing requirements for dance and theater. Also, states should establish alternative routes for individuals who are practicing artists. Higher education institutions should be included in the review of licensure requirements to ensure implementation of the requirements for preparation and licensure. In addition, states should incorporate the arts into licensure requirements for administrators. Many decisions about curriculum happen at the local level, and having leaders that understand the importance of the arts is crucial to their survival in the curriculum.

Recommendation 2 Ensure adequate time for high-quality professional development for staff in the arts.

State education officials also should help to establish relationships between local school districts and universities in order to provide arts teachers with an adequate system for professional development. Many people within artistic communities across the nation aid teachers and consider their professional development a top priority; however, there is still much that state policymakers can do. Data show that hardly any states require professional development that specifically focuses on the arts. State policymakers must ensure that adequate time, funding and opportunities are available for high-quality professional development for arts instructors.

Recommendation 3 Ensure adequate staff expertise at the state education agency to work in the arts.

Another component of efforts to ensure strong arts programs that easily falls to the wayside in times of fiscal belt-tightening is the number of individuals in the state education agency who focus on these content areas. It is important to designate staff to focus solely on the arts in order to implement policy and ensure compliance. Having adequate personnel at the state agency also ensures that local school districts have a resource for keeping abreast of national, state and other local developments. At a minimum, creating these positions, or keeping them funded if they already exist, ensures advocates at the state level for instruction in arts.

Recommendation 4

Incorporate the arts into core graduation requirements, while simultaneously increasing the credits required for graduation.

Another critical component to an education system for students is grade-level expectations and graduation requirements. For the arts, nearly three quarters of the states mandate some form of arts education in public schools, while more than half require arts education in order to graduate. However, the numbers are misleading. For example, in many states the Carnegie unit requirements for the arts are far below those of other core subject areas, and in some cases, "related" subjects, such as home economics can he substituted.

Graduation requirements, as they exist, allow many high school students across the country

to spend a significant portion of their senior year in study hall, thus wasting valuable learning time. More attention has recently been given to this lack of challenging coursework for high school seniors. State policymakers should incorporate the arts into core graduation requirements, while simultaneously increasing the number of credits required for graduation. This allows a student some leeway in deciding which courses to take, while providing an important opportunity to experience the arts during what has become "down time" for students nearing graduation.

Recommendation 5

Encourage higher education institutions to increase standards for admission and include arts courses when calculating high school grade point averages.

With enrollment in postsecondary institutions increasing, admission requirements also are playing a role in what students are taking during their secondary years. Two important issues for consideration are whether the arts are required for university admission and whether arts courses are included in a student's grade point average calculation for university admission. Higher education has an important role in this regard. The study group recommends that higher education institutions increase standards for admission by including the arts as part of the required coursework, and using these classes in calculating a student's grade point average. By increasing requirements for admission, K-12 policies would follow suit, having a positive effect for all, including those who do not go on to a four-year institution.

Only a few states have policies that require coursework in arts education for university admission. While K-12 policymakers may not have authority to set college admissions requirements, they can develop a policy that requires the inclusion of arts and foreign language courses in calculating high school grade point averages. Several associations have examined the issue of grade point average calculation in recent years and found a link between the courses recommended by guidance counselors and what students take. Establishing strong policy that includes the arts in calculating grade point averages can provide an incentive for students to take such courses and properly recognizes the work of students whose interests and abilities may be in the arts. One state that has such a policy is Florida, which now requires schools to include courses in the arts when calculating a student's GPA.

Curriculum and instruction

The act of developing state standards has not necessarily translated into more or better classroom instruction for many students across the country. Thus, it is important for states to not only have in place a set of comprehensive standards for students and teachers, but to ensure that those standards are being implemented in K-12 classrooms, as well as teacher education programs throughout the country.

In a recent poll commissioned by Americans for the Arts, more than 90% of respondents agreed that the arts are vital to providing a wellrounded education for our children.

In order for teachers and administrators to implement state standards for students at the classroom level, the study group recommends several strategies that should be employed to ensure success.

Recommendation 6

Incorporate arts learning in the early years into standards, curriculum frameworks and course requirements. Also, encourage local school districts to incorporate the arts into instruction in the early years, whenever possible.

Introducing the arts to children at an early age is important to students' success in this area and can be important in other areas as well. For example, research has consistently shown the benefits of music for brain development. Brain scans reveal that almost all of the cerebral cortex is active while a musician performs. Studies also have revealed the positive impact music has on improving reading scores, as well as on subjects that require spatial-temporal reasoning, such as mathematics and science.

Early childhood education is just beginning to earn the recognition it deserves as a critical key to student achievement in later years. Recently, federal, state, and local policy and practice have begun to recognize the benefits of early intervention, instead of waiting to intervene until a child falls behind. As with reading, the more learning that occurs in preschool and the early elementary grades in the arts, the less likely our nation's children are to be "left behind" and the less likely we are to leave half the child's education behind.

Recommendation 7 Advocate continued development of curriculum materials for the arts from the textbook publishing industry.

While there is a wealth of arts education materials available through community and philanthropic organizations and the Internet, it may not always be an organized curricular program that is grade-level appropriate or aligned with state standards. State education officials should advocate continued development of curriculum materials from the textbook publishing industry, with a focus on textbooks and instructional resources for students in k-12.

Accountability and assessment

As standards-based reform efforts continue to sweep through the education system, proponents of many so-called "peripheral" subjects, such as the arts, have to fight for their place in the school day. Accountability has been the cornerstone of these reforms over the past two decades, mostly in the form of standardized assessments. Unfortunately, Congress' decision in writing NCLB to focus on assessing only a few key subject areas, coupled with reluctance from state legislatures to assess beyond a few core areas, has contributed to the marginalization of the arts in the curriculum. Many in the education field are concerned that local school districts are emphasizing those few subjects being tested at the expense of other important components of a comprehensive education, such as the arts. While it can be argued that assessment is only one component of accountability, the unfortunate reality is that in many schools, what is assessed is taught.

In addition, while those in the arts education field have been lobbying for years for the development of high-quality assessment tools, the complexity and expense of testing in these fields has made lawmakers reluctant to think of them in terms of high-stakes accountability. Until policymakers and the public are no longer content with multiple-choice assessments and test scores, and understand that such assessments simply cannot measure the full range of human intelligence, arts education is at a severe disadvantage. However, the study group developed the following recommendations that state policymakers can use to ensure a stronger position for the arts. The need for assessments in the arts is clear — without them, the arts will continue to be marginalized at the expense of those core areas that are tested. But beyond being included in the assessment system, it is crucial that the arts become part of state accountability systems, as well.

Recommendation 8

Incorporate all core subject areas, including the arts, into the improvement strategies promoted by the No Child Left Behind Act.

NCLB gave powerful recognition to the arts by including them as core academic subjects in a well-rounded, comprehensive education something that had not been done in past authorizations of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act. Thus, NCLB empowers states and schools to focus on a well-rounded, comprehensive education, which in turn allows states to reevaluate their policy frameworks including accountability structures — for all core subject areas.

Specific to assessment, policy can be developed in a variety of ways to meet the needs of an individual state. For example, states and local districts could form regional coalitions to help alleviate the expense of test development. A policy also could be adopted that would allow local districts to use state approved assessments, regardless of who developed them. Another option would be to allow for local school districts or regional consortia to determine the most effective methods for assessing students, whether it is performance tasks or portfolios. Regardless of the option that best suits a particular state's needs, the important factor is to align any assessment measures with state standards, curriculum frameworks or other requirements.

The grade levels of the assessments are also an important consideration for policymakers. One option for states to consider is to develop and administer assessments at the eighth grade as a way of maintaining and building K-8 programs for all students. This would incorporate the earlier discussions on the importance of early learning in the arts. States that already test students in the eighth grade in many curricular areas may want to opt for another grade for assessing students in the arts.

States also should consider other possible accountability measures as alternatives to assessment. Program monitoring is one option, as is required reporting. States that move in this direction would need to have strong policy in place in order to monitor compliance.

Recommendation 9

Urge the National Assessment Governing Board to increase the frequency in the administration of National Assessment of Educational Progress assessments for the arts.

The arts are included in National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) assessments. However, contrasting the frequency with which NAEP is assessed in mathematics, compared with the arts, has sent a less than encouraging signal to the states about the importance of the arts as a core subject. It also reduces the potential that states will benefit from the release of test items, results of validity and reliability field tests of assessment exercises, and other ways in which the federal-state relationship works for math, reading, writing and science in large-scale assessment.

Funding

Funding is a cornerstone of every state and local educational system, as well as for every curricular area. In that regard, the arts are no different. However, competition with other core areas has also placed arts programs low in the pecking order for funding.

Recommendation 10

Urge Congress and state legislatures to make a greater commitment to the arts.

At the federal level, the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA) is the primary federal agency that supports arts education. Congress created NEA (as well as the National Endowment for the Humanities) in 1965 as an independent agency of the federal government. Funding for the NEA hovers around \$125 million. In stark contrast, the funding level for the National Science Foundation (NSF) hovers around \$5 *billion* — with about \$1 billion going toward K-16 activities.

The U.S. Department of Education also provides minimal funding resources for the arts to states and local school districts (the current allocation is approximately \$36 million). Further, spending figures on arts education in general indicate that while the majority of funds for supplementary arts programs at the elementary level came from school district funds, ranging from 44% to 6%, roughly 40% of funding still came from parents. This practice exacerbates the gap in art opportunities between high- and low-income students. The study group believes it is critical that Congress and state legislatures make a greater commitment to the arts and humanities, including foreign languages. Additional funding should be made available to states, universities and local school districts to help develop programs surrounding the arts, as well as high-quality assessment systems.

Others in the public and private sector have a role to play as well. Only a small portion of the nearly \$266 billion that is spent on K-12 education comes from the federal movement. There are many groups with a stake in arts education, such as representatives from higher education, business, state art agencies, independent arts organizations and cultural institutions. By working together, these groups not only have the opportunity to enhance the arts education dialogue, but to increase the pool of resources and supporters of the efforts for a comprehensive education.

After intense study and deliberation, these are the recommendations the study group on the Lost Curriculum believes will move state education systems to place the arts firmly in the position of being a true core subject. Adopting the policies suggested by the Study Group will ensure that the arts do not get "lost," and that they become a firm part of the educational foundation of every American student.

Lori Meyer is project director at the National Association of State Boards of Education. She was lead staff to the Study Group on the Lost Curriculum.

This article first appeared in the State Education Standard, the journal of the National Association of State Boards of Education, Winter 2004. Copies of this issue, devoted to the place of the arts in the curriculum, can be ordered online at www.nasbe.org or by calling (800) 220-5183. The cost is \$10 plus shipping.

Characteristics of students highly involved in the arts

There are two basic arguments for teaching the arts. One is that the arts should be taught because of the academic and social gains to which they might contribute. The other argument attests to their inherent value. This section will focus on studies that support both of these arguments. The first study explores the relationship between arts involvement and academic achievement. The second explores the relationship between arts education and gains in arts-related skills.

Over 10 years, the National Educational Longitudinal Survey tracked 25,000 secondary school students. In *Involvement in the Arts and Human Development*, **James Catterall**, **Richard Chapleau** and **John Iwanaga** use this survey to examine the characteristics of students that are highly involved in the arts, as well as those of students who are not. In addition to examining these characteristics among all students of a particular grade level, the researchers also examined these characteristics specific to students who were of low socioeconomic status. The researchers found that among all students, those with higher levels of arts involvement were more likely to be high achievers on tests, less likely to drop out by grade 10, and more engaged with learning during the school day. They found that this relationship applied both to the students in aggregate, and to students of low socioeconomic status. The table below displays these results.

	All Students		Low SES Students		
	High Arts	Low Arts	High Arts	Low Arts	
Grade 8	U		C		
Earning mostly As and Bs in English	79.2%	64.2%	64.5%	56.4%	
Scoring in top two quartiles on					
standardized tests	66.8%	42.7%	29.5%	24.5%	
Dropping out by grade 10	1.4%	4.8%	6.5%	9.4%	
Bored in school at least half the time	42.2%	48.9%	41%	46%	
Grade 10					
Scoring in top two quartiles, standardized test					
composite	72.5%	45%	41.4%	24.9%	
Scoring in top two quartiles, reading	70.9%	45.1%	43.8%	28.4%	
Scoring in top two quartiles, history, citizenship,					
geography	70.9%	46.3%	41.6%	28.6%	

Source: Involvement in the Arts and Human Development, Champions of Change: the Impact of the Arts on Learning (Washington, DC: Arts Education Partnership, 1999), 1-18.

While the difference between students with high arts involvement and low arts involvement is notable, the researchers are careful to state that their study does not determine why arts participants were more likely to achieve academically. Therefore, there is no proven causal relationship between arts involvement and student achievement. Causal proof notwithstanding, arts participants were more likely to score in the top two quartiles, stay in school and be engaged in their studies.

Arts achievement

In an academic environment driven by results, it becomes important to measure whether students receiving arts instruction are achieving measurable performance standards. It may also be worthwhile to examine which factors, aside from the mere presence of arts instruction, most greatly affect student achievement in the arts.

NAEP has administered tests in mathematics, reading, writing and history, among other subjects, since 1969. In 1997, the NAEP administered tests to eighth-grade students in public and nonpublic schools in various arts subjects. Nearly 2,300 students were tested in music; approximately 1,400 in theater; and close to 3,000 in the visual arts. For each subject area students were assessed in their ability to create, perform and respond. Among the findings:

• Higher average scores in music (creating and performing) were noted among students who were taught music in a room dedicated to that purpose.

• Students who received art instruction in a room dedicated to that purpose also had higher average scores in creating.

• Higher test scores were associated with higher levels of education of at least one of the student's parents.

• Increased frequency of instruction did *not* correspond to increased scores.

• The position of the arts instructor (i.e., fulltime, part-time, classroom teacher, etc.) did *not* correspond to increased or decreased test scores.

• The presence of a visiting artist did *not* correspond to increased or decreased test scores.

Because adults with higher levels of educational attainment are more likely to participate in the arts, it may be that those individuals, through their interest, are offering their children greater exposure to the arts. However, it is worth noting that neither the frequency of instruction, nor the position of the arts instructor, or the presence of a visiting artist affected student test scores.

Report shows the arts' critical link to student development

Cutting back on school arts programs may prove counterproductive, according to a report by the Arts Education Partnership (AEP). "Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development" finds that the arts provide critical links for students to develop crucial thinking skills and motivations they need to achieve at higher levels and not be left behind. The studies in this report further suggest that for certain populations — students from economically disadvantaged circumstances, students needing remedial instruction and young children — the effects of learning in the arts may be especially robust and able to boost learning and achievement.

The report details the relationship between learning in dance, drama, music, multiple arts and visual arts, and the development of fundamental academic and social skills. It suggests that educators think twice before cutting the arts if their goal is to increase student academic achievement.

AEP is administered by Council of Chief State School Officers (CCSSO) and the National Assembly of State Arts Agencies through a cooperative agreement with the National Endowment for the Arts and the U.S. Department of Education.

"Critical Links" is a compendium reviewing 62 studies of arts learning in dance, drama, music, multiple arts and visual arts. Interpretive essays examine the implications of the studies in each of these areas, and an overview essay explores the issue of the transfer of learning from the arts to other academic and social outcomes.

The report outlines the important relationships between learning in the arts and academic and social skills in the following major areas:

• Reading and language development — Certain forms of arts instruction enhance and complement basic reading instruction aimed at helping children "break the phonetic code" that unlocks written language by associating letters, words and phrases with sounds, sentences and meanings. Reading comprehension, and speaking and writing skills also are improved.
● Mathematics — Certain music instruction develops spatial reasoning and spatial-temporal reasoning skills, which are fundamental to understanding and using mathematical ideas and concepts.

• Fundamental thinking skills and capacities — Learning in individual art forms, as well as in multiple arts experiences, engages and strengthens such fundamental cognitive capacities as spatial reasoning, conditional reasoning, problem-solving and creative thinking.

• Motivations to learn — Learning in the arts nurtures motivation, including active engagement, disciplined and sustained attention, persistence, and risk-taking, and also increases attendance and educational aspirations.

• Effective social behavior — Studies of student learning in certain arts activities show student growth in self-confidence, self-control, self-identity, conflict resolution, collaboration, empathy and social tolerance.

• School environment — Studies show that the arts help to create the kind of learning environment that is conducive to teacher and student success by fostering teacher innovation, a positive professional culture, community engagement, increased student attendance and retention, effective instructional practice, and school identity.

"Critical Links" is available in a pdf on the AEP Web site (www.aep-arts.org). To order printed copies, contact CCSSO publications at (202) 336-7016.

Ohio's K-12 fine arts standards

According to the State Board of Education, Ohio's fine arts academic content standards provide clear, rigorous expectations for all students in kindergarten through 12th grade. The study of fine arts is important to the basic education of all students. The intent of the fine arts standards is to ensure that students experience, understand and value the arts in their everyday lives as contributing citizens of a diverse society. The fine arts standards encourage meaningful connections to concepts and topics studied in other content areas, without compromising the integrity of each arts discipline.

The fine arts standards include the disciplines of dance, drama/theater, music and visual art. The four arts disciplines share five overarching content standards that represent what all students should know and be able to do as they progress through a comprehensive, sequential arts education program. Although the standards were developed specifically for Ohio, arts educators will see a relationship to the National Standards for Arts Education (1994).

The overarching standards for the fine arts are:

- historical, cultural and social contexts;
- creative expression and communication;
- analyzing and responding;
- valuing the arts/aesthetic reflection;
- connections, relationships and applications. The five standards are interrelated and

should be viewed holistically — each standard contributing to a comprehensive arts education.

The standards address the essential knowledge and skills in the arts that students can use to express themselves and communicate with others. Learning in the arts encourages the development of cognitive and creative abilities that help students achieve academically and contribute to their communities. Also, learning in the arts forges connections between and among core themes and topics common to all disciplines.

Success in meeting the expectations of the fine arts standards depends on students' opportunities to receive instruction on a regular basis and to engage actively in the artistic processes — responding to, creating and performing works of art. They should be able to produce and practice an arts discipline in a supportive environment that is conducive to providing individual and group experiences.

By the end of 12th grade, all students should experience the fine arts: dance, drama/theater, music and visual art; study at least one art form in depth; understand the arts as a means of expression; and be prepared to use their arts knowledge and skills throughout their lives.

The complete state standards for fine arts are available as a downloadable pdf file on the Ohio Department of Education Web site. To obtain the 340-page electronic document, visit: http://ims.ode.state.oh.us/ODE/IMS/ACS/ Content/fine_arts_standards.pdf.

Lima City Schools adopt arts content standards

In February 2004, the Lima City Schools became the first district to adopt Ohio's Academic Content Standards for Fine Arts. The process used by the Lima Board of Education to adopt the standards was outlined by Michael Huffman, the district's director of arts/magnet programs, in a presentation made to the Ohio Alliance for Arts Education's (OAAE) board of directors. The OAAE's Arts Eduction News ran the following excerpts from that presentation in its Spring 2004 issue.

Why is it important for districts to adopt Ohio's Academic Content Standards for Fine Arts?

With the passage of NCLB, the arts attained status as a "core" subject, along with language arts, math, science and social studies. This status brought with it opportunities as well as, at least at the federal level, more scrutiny over teacher qualifications and content standards in the arts. In December 2003, these standards were adopted by the State Board of Education, with the understanding at the state level that local districts would follow suit.

How was Lima City Schools prepared to adopt the Academic Content Standards for Fine Arts?

The Lima City School District has continually been ahead of the curve in striving for quality content and methodology in arts education. The traditions of the 1950s and 1960s gave our programs a strong platform of community respect to build a better system upon. As early as 1984, Lima's teachers helped to develop a curriculum guide for grades one through 12 under the tutelage of the Ohio Department of Education (ODE). Requests for this guide were made by many Ohio districts and also from districts in other states, which attest to its value.

In 1989, Lima City Schools were the first

district outside of the immediate Columbus area to join the Ohio Partnership for the Visual Arts, a Getty Foundation-funded effort that worked with The Ohio State University and ODE to make discipline-based arts education consistent throughout the state and country.

In 1996, Lima City Schools pursued funding through a community consortium to provide intensive professional development during the summer to embed the Competency Based Curriculum Model adopted by the State Board of Education.

The President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities, in 1998, recognized Lima City Schools in its report "Gaining the Arts Advantage, Lessons for School Districts that Value Arts Education." This national study identified several conditions that lead to highquality arts education programs for students, and found that Lima met those conditions.

Given the district's history of involvement, leadership and innovation in arts education, it was incumbent upon Lima City Schools to take a stance again in adopting the new Content Standards for Arts Education.

After tradition and history, what conditions are necessary to ensure that arts education is supported in a district?

Trust. It is important to build personal relationships with the principals and faculty in the schools, the central office administrators and the board of education over time, so that when decisions have to be made on important issues, the decisions are made based on mutual trust, friendship, understanding and respect.

Members of the board of education represent and respond to various segments of the community, and so it is also important to spend time building external support for arts education within the community and among parents.

Being a team player or "one of the boys/girls"

means that you are not isolated in your own classroom and are interested and involved in all district initiatives. In this way, arts education is included in the conversation when general education issues are being discussed.

Taking on leadership roles in the district is vital. The context for success in a district is to keep the arts in the bigger, comprehensive picture by communicating, providing services and being at the table when decisions are made.

What strategies can you recommend to ensure that teachers of the arts are professionally supported?

Setting goals, meeting together monthly and participating in professional development are important for building and sustaining a quality arts education program and general education program. Establishing relationships with other educators and being an "education leader" in the school, district or community will lead to a better professional environment overall, where arts education is included as a matter of course. We also meet regularly with principals to discuss ways to bring the arts into their classrooms through a thematic, integrated approach. This is an important and useful service that we provide for them, and that they appreciate.

How were Lima teachers involved in the process to adopt the Academic Content Standards for Fine Arts?

One of our music teachers was a member of the standards writing team, and kept us informed about the process. This was very useful, and an example of someone accepting a leadership role. We also reviewed the drafts of the standards as they were being developed to see how they would align with our curriculum. Using a thematic approach, we constantly look at ways to integrate the arts throughout the curriculum.

How have you handled the increased time devoted to standardized testing?

Again, it is a matter of relying on relationships and being willing to work with the curriculum specialists in math, language arts, science and social studies to develop a continuous improvement plan that includes the arts.

About the Ohio Alliance for Arts Education

The Ohio Alliance for Arts Education (OAAE) works in partnership with the Ohio Arts Council and the Ohio Department of Education to promote high-quality arts education programs in Ohio for all students. The OAAE was founded in 1974 and boasts membership of more than 20 statewide organizations and thousands of individuals that support the arts and arts education.

The OAAE is affiliated nationally with arts education organizations through the Kennedy Center Alliance for Arts Education Network, a program of the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts in Washington, D.C.

For more information about the OAAE contact the organization by telephone: (614) 224-1060; fax: (614) 241-5329; email: info@oaae.net. Visit the OAAE website at www.oaae.net.

Questions to ask about your school art program

The National Art Education Association prepared a brochure for school board members to assist them as they assess their district's art program needs and to develop ways to implement a balanced art program. These questions are applicable to all arts disciplines (dance, drama/theatre, music and visual art).

Policy

Does the state or district have written education goals that include the study of art?
Do the school goals include the study of art?
What was the status of art programs in the state and regional accreditation reports?
What were their recommendations for art and are they being addressed?

□ Are presentations on the art program included in reports to the board?

Program intent

□ Is there a districtwide director, supervisor, coordinator or chairperson to lead the art program?

□ Is the instructional program conducted by teachers certified in arts education, or does the program rely on visiting artists and other volunteers?

□ Is the art program appropriately scheduled, with adequate time allocated for necessary instruction and learning to be effective, or are art classes sandwiched in between other subjects?

Curriculum intent

□ Is there a written art curriculum for each grade level K-12?

Does it include aspects of making art, the historical study of art, and skills by which students may make more informed judgments about art objects?

□ Are there specific competency goals, indicators and measures listed in the curriculum that focus upon basic learning skills in art, as one finds with any other discipline? □ Is art considered a basic subject in its own right, as important as math, science and language?

Is art related to other subjects in the curriculum, so as to contribute its unique insights to those subjects, for example, by bringing works of art into the social studies class to demonstrate the values and ideas of people in certain times and cultures?
 Is art compared and contrasted with the kind of knowledge that science or math provides?
 Is student art valued by the school by attractively exhibiting it in the classroom, offices and prominent hallways, or is it used only for decorative purposes, such as dance decorations?

Does the school sponsor a student exhibit and invite parents, school administrators and community leaders to the opening?
 Does artwork represent the concept of problem recognition/problem solution?

Teaching process

□ Do the teachers present art lessons in an in-depth, dynamic way, explaining thoroughly, eliciting questions and responses from students, and encouraging individual self-criticism of artworks in progress?

□ Do students interact with teachers and one another discussing artworks by noted artists, as well as their own creative expressions?

Do follow-up critiques and discussions, after students complete works of art, represent an open and free exchange between the teacher and students?

□ Do teachers bring in examples of artwork, as well as rich textures, patterns, natural objects, and manufactured forms to help enrich students' aesthetic understanding?

□ Is the perceptual awareness of students' environment being expanded?

□ Are there displayed in the classrooms examples of student art, reproductions of art from various periods, natural objects, unusual textures and colors?

Is each student's spoken, written and created art expression valued, and are positive suggestions offered for ways to improve the quality and to develop the idea further?
 Are students taught to evaluate their own art?

□ Does the art room reflect enthusiasm, intensity, ease and acceptance that add up to a place where real and lasting learning is going on?

Equipment, materials and supplies

□ Are the necessary art supplies available to the in order to fully implement a comprehensive art education program?

□ Are computers available for the study of graphics, desktop publishing, art research and communication?

□ Are there supplies for painting, drawing, printmaking, sculpture, photography and fine crafts, in addition to slides and reproductions for art history?

□ Are textbooks provided for all levels of art instruction?

Do libraries have art resources, such as art books, slides, films, computers and videotapes?
 Is there proper equipment in the art room to carry out an art program such as: computers, ceramic wheels, kilns, printing press, looms, water, paper cutters, projection screen, etc.?

Are the necessary expendable materials provided for every student, such as paint, inks, paper, clay, fibers, brushes, etc.?
Is there an equal appropriation of funds to each art teacher's budget in the school system?
Does the school provide for field trips to museums, galleries or other places in the community for broadening the visual experience of the students?

Professional development

□ Is there a regularly scheduled program of inservice workshops and seminars on art education?

Are teachers members of the local, state and national professional art education associations?
 Are teachers provided release time to attend state and national art conferences?

□ Are teachers involved in assessing and updating the art curriculum in order to meet the demands of change?

□ Are art teachers encouraged to make presentations of their program, discuss the values of art education or exhibit student work at PTA meetings, faculty meetings or other community gatherings?

□ Are art educators used as local resources to conduct staff development workshops for all other instructional personnel in the school or district?

Additional resources

Arts education associations

Ohio Alliance for Arts Education www.oaae.net

Ohio Arts Council www.oac.state.oh.us

Ohio Art Educators Association www.oaea.org

Ohio Citizens for the Arts www.ohiocitizensforthearts.org

OhioDance www.ohiodance.org

Ohio Educational Theatre Association http://ohiothespians.org/

Ohio Music Education Association www.omea-ohio.org

American Alliance for Theatre and Education www.aate.com

Kennedy Center Alliance for Arts Education Network www.kennedy-center.org

National Arts Education Association www.naea-reston.org

National Association for Music Education www.menc.org

National Dance Education Organization www.ndeo.org

Educational Theatre Association www.edta.org

Reports and studies

The Arts Beyond the School Day: Extending the Power, Kennedy Center Alliance for Arts Education Network, 2000.

"Champions of Change, The Impact of the Arts on Learning," Arts Education Partnership, 1999.

"Continuous Improvement What's Working," ODE 2002.

"Gaining the Arts Advantage: Lessons From School Districts that Value Arts Education," President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities and Arts Education Partnership, 1999.

"Learning for the 21st Century," Partnership for 21st Century Skills, July 2003. www21stcenturyskills.org.

"The Power of Arts Assessment in Teaching and Learning," Ohio Alliance for Arts Education, 2001.

Starting Early, Starting Now, Education Commission of the States, 2001.

"State of the Arts Report 2001," Ohio Arts Council, 2001.

"Status of Arts Education in Ohio's Schools 2001: Ohio Alliance for Arts Education," Ohio Arts Council and ODE.

"U.S. Department of Justice, National Endowment for the Arts, and Americans for the Arts," YouthARTS Development Project, 1996.

Web links

Advocacy kits

Sample kits on advocacy/lobbying, identifying the stakeholder audience, parental involvement, defining objectives, developing a program plan, the legislative process, effective communications, working with the media and policymakers.

www.clpi.org/toc.html

www.ascd.org/advocacykit/

www.principals.org/advocacy/

www.pta.org/parentinvolvement/familyfun/ff_ne aquestions.asp

Arts advocacy links

Key art-related advocacy resources, campaigns and contacts.

ww3.artsusa.org/get_involved/advocate.asp/

www.nasaa-arts.org/publications/advo.shtml

www.aep-arts.org/Advocacy.htm

www.musicfriends.org/

http://www.artsedge.kennedy-center.org/connect

www.vhl.com/insidevhl/savethemus/index.htmI

www.amc-music.comladvocacy/The-crisis.htm

Arts education research and programs

Arts in the Basic Curriculum ABC Project www.winthrop.edu/abc

Brain Research, Jensen Learning Corporation www.jlcbrain.com

Changing Education Through the Arts (CETA) www.kennedy-center.org/education/pdot

Discipline-Based Arts Education www.getty.edu

Lincoln Center Institute for the Arts in Education www.lcinstitute.org

Multiple Intelligences Howard Gardner, Harvard University www.pzweb.harvard.edu/PIs/HG.htm

Performing and Visual Arts Schools www.artsschoolsnetwork.org

SPECTRA+ www.fittoncenter.org

Transforming Education Through the Arts Challenge (TETAC) National Arts Education Consortium www.aep-arts.org for a report.

VH1 Save The Music www.vh1.com

Wolf Trap Institute for Early Learning Through the Arts www.wolf-trap.org

Arts 4 Learning Initiative www.youngaudiences.org

Ohio has many arts-related businesses

According to a new study prepared by Americans for the Arts, more than 548,000 businesses nationwide are involved in the production and delivery of American's "creative industries." These industries include museums and collections, performing arts, visual arts, photography, film, radio, TV, design/publishing, and arts schools and services. They employ 2.99 million people. This information, gathered through the "Creative Industries" study, provides a research-based approach to communicating the scope and importance of the arts to the national economy.

In Ohio, there are 16,937 arts-related industries that employ 89,196 people. Ohio arts-related businesses include: Arts schools and services Businesses — 636 Employees — 2,727 **Design and publishing** Businesses — 4,082 Employees — 23,956 Film, radio and TV Businesses — 2,421 Employees — 18,306 Visual arts Businesses — 6,313 Employees — 24,715 **Museums and collections** Businesses — 441 Employees — 5,523 **Performing arts** Businesses — 3,042 Employees — 13,969